2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

15

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

26

27 28

PERSONNEL COMMISSION

FOR THE MONTEBELLO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

IN THE MATTER OF:

Appointment of Dr. Anthony J. Martinez to classified position of interim/acting Chief of Police of the Montebello Unified School District

ORDER

Hearing dates: 06/04/2019 06/11/2019

After conducting a public hearing, reviewing evidence, and taking sworn testimony, the Personnel Commission of the Montebello Unified School District (MUSD) finds that MUSD Superintendent Anthony J. Martinez violated (1) the California Merit System, (2) the California Education Code, and (3) the Rules of the MUSD Personnel Commission when he appointed himself to the classified position of interim/acting Chief of Police of the MUSD. The evidence establishes that Dr. Martinez failed to possess the minimum requirements of the position and failed to follow established examination procedures applicable to appointments to classified positions. Further, Dr. Martinez's self-appointment to the position of MUSD Chief of Police, a California peace officer position, also separately violated California Government Code Section 1031 and multiple related California regulations that mandate the minimum requirements

applicable to all California peace officer appointments.

Accordingly, Dr. Martinez's appointment to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police is VOID.

Pursuant to California Education Code Section 45310 and MUSD Personnel Commission Rule 5.2.16, the MUSD Personnel Commission ORDERS that no salary warrant shall hereinafter be drawn to Dr. Anthony J. Martinez for services of the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police rendered after the date of this Order.

A. DISCUSSION

The California Merit System, adopted by the MUSD more than 80 years ago - in 1938, is detailed in the California Education Code.

Positions in the MUSD classified service are filled pursuant to the California Education Code Merit System provisions² and the MUSD

Personnel Commission Rules.³ The cornerstone of the Merit System is

¹ In 2018, public sources reported that Dr. Martinez was involved in the sale to a former MUSD employee of an MUSD vehicle previously used by the MUSD police. (See https://www.loscerritosnews.net/2018/06/21/montebello-unified-violated-education-code-in-selling-surplus-property-to-former-director/). Though that vehicle was worth thousands of dollars, the vehicle was sold for less than \$1,000. That non-public sale of MUSD property for less than fair market value likely violated the law. However, because Dr. Martinez's conduct in that matter pre-dated his appointing himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police in late 2018, the Personnel Commission disregarded that previous transaction for purposes of this Order.

² Article 6 of Chapter 5 of Part 25 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the California Education Code, entitled "Merit System," contains multiple Merit System Education Code sections.

³ The Personnel Commission's Rules "shall provide for the procedures to be followed by the governing board as they pertain to the classified service regarding applications, examinations, eligibility, appointments, promotions, demotions, transfers, dismissals, resignations, layoffs, reemployment, vacations, leaves of absence, compensation within classification, job analyses and specifications, performance evaluations, public advertisement of examinations, rejection of unfit applicants without competition, and any other matters necessary to carry out the provisions and purposes of this article." (Cal. Educ. Code § 45261(a).)

ensuring a fair and transparent hiring process for all classified positions: the selection, retention, and promotion of classified employees on the basis of individual merit and fitness demonstrated by competitive examinations and performance. The Merit System is described as "the concept of employment, continuance in employment, in-service promotional opportunities, and other related matters on the basis of merit and fitness." (Cal. Educ. Code § 45244(c).)

As detailed below, MUSD Superintendent Dr. Martinez disregarded and violated the Merit System when he appointed himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, because he (1) failed to possess the minimum requirements of the position and (2) failed to follow the established examination procedures applicable to the classified service. This appointment was particularly egregious, given that the classified position at issue is a peace officer position responsible for the safety of MUSD's students and employees.

1. Dr. Martinez failed to possess the minimum requirements for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police.

The first step in the Personnel Commission's analysis is to determine whether Dr. Martinez possessed the minimum requirements for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police. (See MUSD PC Rule 4.1.2 ("All applicants must possess all other requirements that are specified in the qualifications established for the class.").) As discussed below, Dr. Martinez did not possess the minimum qualifications for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, and he so admitted during his testimony in front of the Commission on June 4, 2019.4

⁴ "The commission may conduct hearings, subpoena witnesses, require the production of records or information pertinent to

MUSD publishes the requirements for classified positions on its website. The Job Description for MUSD Chief of Police available on MUSD's website listed various requirements for the job, including the "MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS" for the job. During his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez testified that before deciding to appoint himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, he failed to review - or even look at - the established requirements for that classified position; in his words: "I never looked at the job description."

Under the "Knowledge of" part of the minimum qualifications, the job description lists as #7, "Proper techniques for evidence gathering, handling, documentation and preservation," and as #8, "Techniques used for conducting a criminal investigation." During his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he did not possess the requisite knowledge to meet those job requirements.

Under the "Ability to" part of the minimum qualifications listed on the Job Description for MUSD Chief of Police, it lists as #4, "Make criminal arrests and conduct criminal investigations." During his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he did not possess those abilities.

Under the "Education, Training, and Experience" part of the minimum qualifications listed on the job description for MUSD Chief of Police, it requires either: (1) a master's degree and 4 years of experience as a peace officer; or (2) a bachelor's degree and 6 years of experience as a peace officer. Under either of those options, the job description specifies that a minimum of 3 years of experience

investigation, and may administer oaths." (Cal. Gov't Code § 45311.) The Personnel Commission appreciates that at the Commission's request, Dr. Martinez voluntarily appeared to testify.

must have been at the rank of Sergeant or higher, "directly supervising law enforcement." Dr. Martinez testified that he did not have any experience as a peace officer, much less the minimum of four years' experience. Thus, he failed to meet the Training and Experience requirements of this classified position.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Aside from the above delineated specific deficiencies, 5 during his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he did not think he met the requirements for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police at all. Dr. Martinez put in quite succinctly: "I don't meet the qualifications." Later during his testimony, Dr. Martinez reiterated that he didn't have any of the requirements of the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police: "So as I mentioned earlier, if you look at this entire job description, the answer would be 'no.'"6

⁵ Under "Licenses; Certificates; Special Requirements," the MUSD Chief of Police job description requires "[p]ossession of either a California P.O.S.T. supervisory or management certificate." Dr. Martinez does not have either of those POST certificates, which require prior experience as a peace officer. Policy 101 of the MUSD Police Department Policy Manual provides that the MUSD Chief of Police shall as a condition of continued employment "obtain the Basic Certificate by POST within two years of appointment." That internal MUSD Police Department policy does not conflict with the MUSD Chief of Police job description because those are different POST certificates, i.e., "Basic Certificate" versus "supervisory or management certificate." According to POST's website, the Commission on POST issues seven professional certificates to peace officers: (1) Basic Certificate; (2) Intermediate Certificate; (3) Advanced Certificate; (4) Supervisory Certificate; (5) Management Certificate; (6) Executive Certificate; and (7) Reserve Officer Certificate.

⁶ Dr. Martinez testified that he believed that under one subsection of the Education Code dealing with school police officers, he was not required to meet the minimum requirements of the position before he appointed himself to the MUSD Chief of Police position, and that he had one year to meet any requirements. He testified that he did not seek any legal advice to form that opinion, but instead, he testified that he relied solely upon an alleged verbal statement of the LACOE fiscal advisor. Putting aside the exact contours of what he was told, Dr. Martinez misconstrues that subdivision of the

Thus, Dr. Martinez does not possess the minimum requirements for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police. Accordingly, he was completely unqualified to even sit for the examination of - much less appoint himself to - that public safety classified position.

5

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

1516

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

26

27

28

appoint oneself to a classified position, even though not meeting the job requirements, was unreasonable, particularly without seeking and obtaining written legal advice on the issue.

California Education Code Section 38000(c) provides that the minimum qualifications for a school chief of police position should

California Education Code. Further, taking an informal statement of one person as the complete basis to bypass the entire Merit System to

include prior employment as a peace officer or completion of a POSTapproved peace officer training course, but further states that the "school chief of police shall comply with the prior employment or training requirement set forth in this subdivision as of ... a date one year subsequent to the initial employment of the chief of security or school chief of police by the school district, whichever occurs later." This specific subsection does not brush as broadly as Dr. Martinez claims. First, by its plain terms, that subsection applies only to the "prior employment or training requirement" of the job specifications - not all job requirements. That subsection does not purport to govern or exempt the other specific requirements of the position, such as applicable here, the 14 "minimum qualifications" and 19 "ability to" requirements specified in the job description that were independent of any prior employment or training requirements, which Dr. Martinez testified he did not meet. Second, that subsection does not address the background investigation, psychological examination, and other mandatory requirements separately imposed by California Government Code 1031, which was also a specific requirement of the MUSD Chief of Police position ("must meet the requirements of government code 1031."). Last, during his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez testified that he never intended to undergo the required training during that one-year period. And, as explained during Dr. Martinez's testimony, it is obviously impossible to obtain 4 years of experience as a peace officer, "supplemented by a minimum of three (3) years experience, at the level of Sergeant or higher rank, directly supervising law enforcement" within one year, i.e., a person cannot squeeze four years of experience into a one year window.

Therefore, Section $38000\,\mathrm{(c)}$ is inapposite with limited application here.

⁷ The MUSD Personnel Commission Rules also provide that even provisional appointees must possess all the qualifications for the classification before being appointed.

3

5

7

9

8

10

11 12

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

2425

26

27

28

2. Dr. Martinez violated the Merit System, the California

Education Code, and the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules by

appointing himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief

of Police without following the required procedures

applicable to classified examinations and appointments.

The evidence before the Personnel Commission established that in late 2018, sometime after former MUSD Chief of Police L. Dinh resigned from that position (in approximately July/August 2018), Dr. Martinez appointed himself to the classified position of interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police and held himself out publically as the interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police. During his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez confirmed that he had appointed himself into the position of MUSD Chief of Police. Dr. Martinez made that same representation to the Personnel Commission in open session during a Personnel Commission meeting he attended earlier in 2019, which prior statement he confirmed making during his testimony on June 4, 2019.8 Further, the 2018-2019 MUSD phone list presented during Dr. Martinez's testimony (Exhibit #1) listed his name under "POLICE SERVICES" as "Interim Police Chief." Other individuals also confirmed that Dr. Martinez held himself out publically as the interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police. Last, during his open session testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez continued to assert that as of the date of the hearing, he remained as the interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police.9

The Personnel Commission was not asked to, nor did it, conduct any recruitment process for the MUSD Chief of Police classified

⁸ Accord 12/11/18 Personnel Commission meeting agenda, item #5
("MUSD Police Department - Chief of Police position").

position to which Dr. Martinez appointed himself. The Personnel Commission did not conduct any examination procedures for the MUSD Chief of Police classified position to which Dr. Martinez appointed himself. Dr. Martinez did not take (or pass) a written, performance, or oral examination for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police. The Personnel Commission did not certify the name of Dr. Martinez on any eligibility list for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police to which Dr. Martinez appointed himself. In short, there was absolutely no process — much less the recruitment, examination, and appointment procedures required by the Merit System, the California Education Code, and the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules — before Dr. Martinez appointed himself to that classified position and began to hold himself out to MUSD employees and the public as the interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police.

Under California law applicable to public school districts like MUSD, vacancies for classified positions must be filled pursuant to the Merit System, as defined by the California Education Code and the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules. (Cal. Educ. Code § 45272(a) ("All vacancies in the classified service shall be filled pursuant to this article and the rules of the commission")). That process involves verifying minimum requirements of the position, fair and transparent recruitment, and fair and objective examination procedures (such as

⁹ Dr. Martinez first testified that he had appointed himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police and had told others that he had done so. While not dispositive to this Order, when subsequently during that same testimony, Dr. Martinez attempted to minimize and obfuscate the number of persons whom he had informed about his self-appointment to that position, Dr. Martinez damaged his credibility before the MUSD Personnel Commission. The Personnel Commission finds that Dr. Martinez did, in fact, inform multiple MUSD personnel about such appointment, including personally telling MUSD police personnel that he was the interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police.

written, oral, and performance examinations), which culminate in an eligibility list certified by the Personnel Commission.

None of that occurred here. In other words, putting aside that Dr. Martinez failed to meet the minimum requirements for the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, even assuming he had possessed those minimum requirements, the Merit System nonetheless required process and procedures to be followed before appointing himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police. Dr. Martinez failed to follow those procedures and process, and instead completely disregarded and bypassed those safeguards of the Merit System so that he could appoint himself as the MUSD Chief of Police.

Thus, Dr. Martinez's appointment of himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police violated the Merit System, the California Education Code, and the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules applicable to recruitment, examination, and appointment procedures. That appointment is even more shocking because during his testimony, Dr. Martinez admitted that before deciding to appoint himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, he did not even look at the job requirements of that classified position.

3. Dr. Martinez's appointment to the peace officer position of MUSD Chief of Police also separately violated California law applicable to all California peace officer positions.

In addition to the two violations detailed above (not possessing the minimum requirements for the position and not following Merit System examination and appointment processes), Dr. Martinez also further violated the California laws applicable to all peace officer appointments in the State of California. In other words, because the MUSD Chief of Police position to which Dr. Martinez appointed himself

is a California peace officer position, additional California laws apply to that position - above and beyond the Merit System and Education Code provisions that otherwise apply because that position is in the classified service.

California Government Code Section 1031 governs all peace officer appointments in California. 10 It specifies multiple mandatory minimum standards that an individual must possess and undergo before he or she can be appointed to a peace officer position in California. Section 1031 requires that, inter alia, all California peace officers: (1) "Be of good moral character, as determined by a thorough background investigation"; and (2) "Be found to be free from any physical, emotional, or mental condition that might adversely affect the exercise of the powers of a peace officer." (Cal. Gov't Code § 1031(d), (f).) 11 The California Code of Regulations flesh out those requirements. Title 11, California Code of Regulations, Section 1950 (entitled "Peace Officer Selection Requirements") provides that all California peace officers must satisfy the following minimum selection requirements:

- Reading and Writing Ability Assessment (Regulation 1951);
- Oral Interview (Regulation 1952);
- Background Investigation (Regulation 1953);
- Medical Evaluation (Regulation 1954); and
- Psychological Evaluation (Regulation 1955).

¹⁰ Even though Section 1031 applies perforce to all California peace officer appointments, the MUSD Chief of Police job description also specifically incorporated Section 1031's requirements here under its job description's "Education, Training, and Experience" minimum qualifications: "must meet the requirements of government code 1031."

 $^{^{11}}$ California law specifies that it is a misdemeanor to impersonate a peace officer. (Cal. Penal Code § 538d.) $$\rm Page~10~of~15$

5

8

10 11

12 13

1415

16

1718

19

2021

22

23

2425

26

27

28

(11 CCR § 1950(a)(1).) That regulation further provides that "[a]ll requirements specified in these regulations shall be satisfied **prior**to the date of employment." (Id. at (a)(2) (emphasis added.)

Background investigation: As detailed above, California Government Code 1031(d) requires a background investigation for all California peace officers. In fact, during his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he knew that one of the requirements to be a police officer was to pass a background investigation. 11, California Code of Regulations, Section 1953 (entitled "Peace Officer Background Investigation") provides in subdivision (a) (entitled "Government Code Mandate"): "Every peace officer candidate shall be the subject of a thorough background investigation to verify good moral character and the absence of past behavior indicative of unsuitability to perform the duties of a peace officer [Government Code section 1031(d)]." (11 CCR § 1953(a).) Such background investigation is intended to be thorough, including evaluating issues such as a person's "Integrity," "Stress Tolerance," and "Decision-Making and Judgment." (Id. at (b).) "Every peace officer candidate shall complete, sign, and date a personal history statement at the onset of the background investigation," which addresses various areas of investigation. (Id. at (c).) The areas of investigation include a criminal records check; driving record check; employment history check; relatives/personal check (including former spouses) in order to determine whether the candidate has exhibited behavior at odds with being a peace officer; evaluation of marriage dissolution documents, "reviewed as an indication of personal integrity, financial responsibility, and other relevant aspects". (Id. at (e).)

Government Code 1031 requires California peace officers to "be found to be free from any physical, emotional, or mental condition that might adversely affect the exercise of the powers of a peace officer." (Cal. Gov't Code § 1031(f).) Title 11, California Code of Regulations, Section 1955 (entitled "Peace Officer Psychological Evaluation") provides in subdivision (a) (entitled "Government Code Mandate/Evaluator Requirements"): "Every peace officer candidate shall be evaluated to determine if the candidate is free from any emotional or mental condition that might adversely affect the exercise of the powers of a peace officer [Government Code section 1031(f)], and to otherwise ensure that the candidate is capable of withstanding the psychological demands of the position." (11 CCR

§ 1955(a).)

During his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he did not meet those requirements — he did not undergo a background investigation, he did not submit to a psychological examination, and he did not receive a physical examination.

Further, the MUSD Police Department is POST-approved agency.
"POST," which stands for the "Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training," was established by the California Legislature in 1959 to set minimum selection and training standards for California law enforcement. POST has determined that an interim Chief of Police must undergo the background investigation and medical and psychological examinations before being appointed, the same as any other peace officer in California:

Every appointment to a peace officer position, regardless of rank or expected tenure in the position, is predicated upon the satisfaction of the selection

standards that are prescribed in Government Codes
Sections 1029-1031, and further described in POST
Commission Regulations 1950-1955. The law does not
provide an exemption for an interim chief of police.

All of the selection standards must be satisfied **prior to** the appointment of a peace officer, including an interim chief of police.

(POST, <u>Position Concerning the Interim Chief of Police</u> at 3 (emphasis added).)

Last, during his testimony on June 4, 2019, Dr. Martinez admitted that he lacked firearms training or qualification.

Thus, independent of MUSD Superintendent Dr. Martinez's violations of the Merit System, the California Education Code, and the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules as detailed above, Dr. Martinez also violated California Government Code Section 1031 by appointing himself to the peace officer position of interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police without first undergoing and passing a background investigation or clearing a psychological examination.

4. As MUSD Superintendent, Dr. Martinez's failure to abide by the Merit System and the California Education Code sent a bad message to the general public and all MUSD employees - specifically classified employees - about the fairness and transparency of MUSD's hiring process.

The crux of the Merit System, adopted by MUSD in 1938, is the fair and transparent hiring process for all classified positions.

Here, as detailed above, Dr. Martinez bypassed that long honored system of checks and balances by appointing himself to the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police, even though he failed to possess

the minimum qualifications for that position and failed to follow the established hiring process and procedures, including examination procedures.

Such conduct by Dr. Martinez - the top cabinet member of the MUSD administration¹² - made a mockery of the Merit System. His violation is even more disturbing because it potentially impacted public safety, given that he appointed himself to a California peace officer position responsible for the safety of MUSD children, even though he admitted he knew that he failed to possess the minimum required qualifications for that position.

Therefore, the Personnel Commission strongly condemns Dr.

Martinez's appointment of himself to be the MUSD Chief of Police,
because by doing so, Dr. Martinez bypassed, violated, and disregarded
(1) the long-established California Merit System, (2) the applicable
Education Code provisions, and (3) the MUSD Personnel Commission
Rules, and he did so for an appointment to a classified position
involving the safety of MUSD children and employees.

B. CONCLUSION

MUSD Superintendent Dr. Anthony J. Martinez's appointment of himself to the classified position of interim/acting MUSD Chief of Police violated California law, including the Merit System and the Education and Government Codes, as well as the MUSD Personnel Commission Rules, as they apply to qualification, examination, and appointment procedures in the MUSD classified service. Accordingly, the MUSD Personnel Commission finds the appointment of Dr. Anthony J. Martinez to the classified position of interim/acting MUSD Chief of

 $^{^{12}}$ As the Superintendent, Dr. Martinez is the CEO (chief executive officer) of the MUSD board of education. (Cal. Educ. Code \$ 35035.)

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	W
27	
28	

Police to be VOID. Therefore, pursuant to California Education Code Section 45310 and MUSD Personnel Commission Rule 5.2.16, the MUSD Personnel Commission ORDERS that no salary warrant shall hereinafter be drawn to Dr. Anthony J. Martinez for services of the classified position of MUSD Chief of Police rendered after the date of this Order.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: 06/11/2019

PERSONNEL COMMISSION
MONTEBELLO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

Charles E. Pell, Chairperson

Yvette L. Fimbres, Vice-Chairperson

Fernando Chacon, Member